

**Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program Employment and Training
2004-2005 Exit Cohort
3-Year Longitudinal Study**

Methodology

The Labor Market and Career Information (LMCI) department of the Texas Workforce Commission (TWC) used 30,088 archived, unique seed records. This was comprised of Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program Employment and Training (SNAP E&T) {formerly Food Stamp Employment and Training (FSE&T)} participants who exited the program between July 1, 2004 and June 30, 2005.¹

The seed records were originally linked to TWC Unemployment Insurance (UI) wage records in the 4th quarter of 2005 to establish a baseline measure for employment and earnings. For the longitudinal snapshot, the seed records were linked to the UI wage records for the 4th quarter of 2007 to determine delayed or long-term program results. Additional employment and earnings linkages were performed with the U.S. Department of Defense (DOD), the U.S. Office of Personnel Management (OPM), and the U.S. Postal Service (USPS). In the case where participants who were found working had earnings greater than or equal to \$25,000 in any target quarter were identified, these records were excluded from analysis based on the likelihood of inaccurate wage record data and to reduce the possibility of inappropriately skewing the data. The archived seed records were sent to the Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board (THECB) to be linked to Fall 2007 public postsecondary master enrollment records to determine if the former participants are now enrolled in a public postsecondary college or university in Texas.

Supplemental linkages were conducted with the Texas Bureau of Vital Statistics (TBVS) to determine deaths, as well as the Texas Department of Criminal Justice (TDCJ) to determine incarcerations. Cohort members who were found to be either deceased or incarcerated during the target quarters were excluded from this study. Exclusions from supplemental linkages resulted in 29,730 usable records.

For this report, only post-exit labor market outcomes were compared from the two study periods to ensure that comparable data are being used. For example, the baseline measure for this cohort did not include earnings data from the federal agencies to which the records were linked because the earnings data received were not compatible with state measures. For the longitudinal snapshot taken in 2007, the earnings data received from federal databases were compatible; however, these data will not be included in this report.

¹ Please reference the [FSE&T](#) chapter of the [ASALFS Final Report 2004-2005](#) for more information regarding the seed records used for this report.

During the 2004-2005 SNAP E&T program year, services were provided to mandatory work registrants. Mandatory work registrants are food stamp recipients who do not meet any of the federal exemption criteria, examples of which are caring for a child less than six years of age, participation in a drug rehabilitation program, or physical disability. Mandatory work registrants consist of two groups: *Able-Bodied Adults Without Dependents (ABAWD)*, and *SNAP E&T General Population*. ABAWD are at least 18 but less than 50 years of age. The receipt of food stamp benefits for ABAWD can be limited for three months out of 36 months if the individuals do not work or participate in SNAP E&T or similar services. SNAP E&T General Population participants are at least 16 but less than 60 years of age and are not classified as an ABAWD.²

Results

A. Cohort Analysis

Cohort analysis looks at the results of the group during the two study periods as two distinct sets of data. In cohort analysis it is possible, even likely, that the same persons identified as working in the baseline study period will not be identical to those found working in the terminal time period. Section B of this report presents data on participants working in both study periods.

Table 1 shows employment and earnings for all working in 4Q2005 by classification. At 4Q2005, participants classified as ABAWD had a higher employment percentage (53.2%) than those classified as General Population. ABAWD also had higher median earnings, \$2,496. Overall employment in 4Q2005 was 52.2 percent with median quarterly earnings of \$2,459.

For program exiters found working in the 4th quarter of 2007 (Table 1a), General Population participants had a higher employment percentage and higher median earnings than their ABAWD counterparts. Overall employment in 4Q2007 was 51.6 percent with median quarterly earnings of \$3,491.

² ASALFS Final Report 2004-2005

Table 1. 4Q2005 Employment and Earnings by Classification

Classification	N	N Working	% Working	Median Earnings
E and T General Population	14747	7531	51.1	\$2,421
ABAWD	14,983	7,976	53.2	\$2,496
Total	29,730	15,507	52.2	\$2,459

Table 1a. 4Q2007 Employment and Earnings by Classification

Classification	N	N Working	% Working	Median Earnings
E and T General Population	14,747	7,862	53.3	\$3,546
ABAWD	14,983	7,475	49.9	\$3,417
Total	29,730	15,337	51.6	\$3,491

Females in the cohort had the highest employment in 4Q2005 at 53.4 percent, while males had the highest median earning with \$2,888 (Table 2). At the longitudinal snapshot in 2007, 54.1 percent of females were found employed, with males employed at 48.5 percent (Table 2a). Male exiters had median earnings of \$4,061 in 4Q2007.

Table 2. 4Q2005 Employment and Earnings by Gender

Gender	N	N Working	% Working	Median Earnings
Male	13192	6672	50.6	\$2,888
Female	16,538	8,835	53.4	\$2,188
Total	29,730	15,507	52.2	\$2,459

Table 2a. 4Q2007 Employment and Earnings by Gender

Gender	N	N Working	% Working	Median Earnings
Male	13,192	6,392	48.5	\$4,061
Female	16,538	8,945	54.1	\$3,195
Total	29,730	15,337	51.6	\$3,491

Excluding those whose ethnicity was unknown, Blacks had the highest employment percentage at 4Q2005 with 54.9 percent employed (Table 3). Hispanics were the largest subgroup. Asians had the highest earnings in 4Q2005 with median earnings of \$2,933. In 2007, Hawaiian Native or Pacific Islanders had the largest percentage of participants employed, 55.8 percent, and posted the highest median earnings, \$4,817 (Table 3a).

Table 3. 4Q2005 Employment and Earnings by Ethnicity

Ethnicity	N	N Working	% Working	Median Earnings
Unknown	37	24	64.9	\$2,611
Hawaiian Native or Pacific Islander	43	20	46.5	\$2,839
Asian	205	99	48.3	\$2,933
Native American	299	158	52.8	\$2,047
White	7967	3816	47.9	\$2,633
Black	10,011	5,498	54.9	\$2,361
Hispanic	11,168	5,892	52.8	\$2,429
Total	29,730	15,507	52.2	\$2,459

Table 3a. 4Q2007 Employment and Earnings by Ethnicity

Ethnicity	N	N Working	% Working	Median Earnings
Unknown	37	22	59.5	\$4,779
Hawaiian Native or Pacific Islander	43	24	55.8	\$4,817
Asian	205	100	48.8	\$4,597
Native American	299	137	45.8	\$2,968
White	7,967	3,741	47.0	\$3,730
Black	10,011	5,313	53.1	\$3,397
Hispanic	11,168	6,000	53.7	\$3,429
Total	29,730	15,337	51.6	\$3,491

Table 4 shows employment and earnings by service received in 4Q2005. Most participants received the Support service, and those participants had 53.8 percent employment in 4Q2005. Participants receiving Occupational/Vocational Training had the highest employment at 4Q2005 with 80.0 percent employed, and also had the highest median quarterly earnings with \$3,793.

In 4Q2007, participants receiving Occupational/Vocational Training had the highest employment with 60.0 percent employed, and again had the highest median quarterly earnings with \$6,165 (Table 4a).

Table 4. 4Q2005 Employment and Earnings by Service Received

Service	N	N Working	% Working	Median Earnings
Occupational / Vocational Training	5	n/a	80.0	\$3,793
Basic Education	20	10	50.0	\$2,451
Workfare	211	113	53.6	\$2,426
Determine Good Cause	931	264	28.4	\$1,649
Unsubsidized Employment	6,628	4071	61.4	\$2,697
Job Search Assistance	7,961	3,525	44.3	\$2,463
Support Service	13,974	7,520	53.8	\$2,352
Total	29,730	15,507	52.2	\$2,459
Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" in order to protect the privacy of cohort members.				

Table 4a. 4Q2007 Employment and Earnings by Service Received

Service	N	N Working	% Working	Median Earnings
Occupational / Vocational Training	5	n/a	60.0	\$6,165
Basic Education	20	11	55.0	\$3,841
Workfare	211	105	49.8	\$3,624
Determine Good Cause	931	286	30.7	\$2,724
Unsubsidized Employment	6,628	3,744	56.5	\$3,648
Job Search Assistance	7,961	3,872	48.6	\$3,624
Support Service	13,974	7,316	52.4	\$3,363
Total	29,730	15,337	51.6	\$3,491
Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" in order to protect the privacy of cohort members.				

Table 5 shows employment and earnings by Local Workforce Development Area (LWDA). Alamo LWDA had the highest percentage of program exiters employed in 4Q2005 with 62.7 percent employed, and in 4Q2007 with 58.3 percent employed. Rural Capital LWDA posted the highest median earnings at 4Q2005 with \$3,196. At the 3-year snapshot, Rural Capital LWDA had the highest median earnings, \$4,507.

Table 5. Employment and Earnings by LWDA

LWDA	N	All Working in 4Q2005			All Working in 4Q2007			
		N Working	% Working	Median Earnings	N	N Working	% Working	Median Earnings
Alamo	1,748	1096	62.7	\$2,813	1,748	1,019	58.3	\$3,759
Brazos Valley	490	265	54.1	\$2,896	490	248	50.6	\$3,796
Cameron County	405	184	45.4	\$1,930	405	191	47.2	\$3,020
Capital Area	589	365	62.0	\$3,002	589	316	53.7	\$4,397
Central Texas	296	154	52.0	\$2,167	296	114	38.5	\$3,609
Coastal Bend	1047	548	52.3	\$2,158	1,047	564	53.9	\$3,023
Concho Valley	329	189	57.5	\$2,507	329	186	56.5	\$3,515
Dallas	2,479	1,348	54.4	\$2,631	2,479	1,326	53.5	\$3,660
Deep East Texas	995	470	47.2	\$1,978	995	448	45.0	\$3,191
East Texas	552	283	51.3	\$2,218	552	272	49.3	\$3,096
Golden Crescent	734	425	57.9	\$2,440	734	400	54.5	\$3,356
Gulf Coast	9,143	4,551	49.8	\$2,597	9,143	4,673	51.1	\$3,841
Heart of Texas	416	232	55.8	\$2,688	416	208	50.0	\$3,218
Lower Rio Grande Valley	2,550	1,190	46.7	\$2,030	2,550	1,362	53.4	\$2,958
Middle Rio Grande	484	237	49.0	\$1,983	484	228	47.1	\$2,744
North Central	676	366	54.1	\$2,812	676	369	54.6	\$3,987
North East Texas	472	208	44.1	\$1,858	472	207	43.9	\$2,781
North Texas	527	294	55.8	\$2,241	527	263	49.9	\$2,990
Panhandle	399	205	51.4	\$2,087	399	190	47.6	\$2,896
Permian Basin	677	392	57.9	\$2,446	677	364	53.8	\$3,447
Rural Capital	128	77	60.2	\$3,196	128	68	53.1	\$4,507
South East Texas	442	235	53.2	\$2,003	442	220	49.8	\$3,308
South Plains	329	173	52.6	\$1,835	329	165	50.2	\$3,207
South Texas	246	135	54.9	\$2,678	246	139	56.5	\$3,638
Tarrant County	1,237	703	56.8	\$3,147	1,237	671	54.2	\$4,200
Texoma	195	85	43.6	\$2,748	195	83	42.6	\$3,321
Unknown	820	420	51.2	\$2,458	820	413	50.4	\$3,175
Upper Rio Grande	793	389	49.1	\$1,939	793	370	46.7	\$2,921
West Central	532	288	54.1	\$2,318	532	260	48.9	\$3,161
Total	29,730	15,507	52.2	\$2,459	29,730	15,337	51.6	\$3,491

Employment Services was the most common industry of employment for program exiters working at 4Q2005 (Table 6). Home Health Care Services and Limited-Service Eating Places were the second and third most common industries of employment. Participants employed in the Other General Merchandise Stores sector had the highest median earnings with \$2,713.

Table 6. Top 10 Industries of Employment for All Working in 4Q2005

Industry of Employment	N Working	Median Earnings	NAICS Code
Employment Services	2,352	\$1,897	5613
Home Health Care Services	1,058	\$1,290	6216
Limited-Service Eating Places	1,036	\$1,613	7222
Elementary and Secondary Schools	665	\$2,173	6111
Other General Merchandise Stores	601	\$2,713	4529
Full-Service Restaurants	557	\$1,744	7221
Nursing Care Facilities	347	\$2,490	6231
Grocery Stores	330	\$2,283	4451
Services to Buildings and Dwellings	321	\$1,948	5617
Gasoline Stations	310	\$2,486	4471

Table 7 shows the top ten industries of employment for all working in the 4th quarter of 2007. Employment Services was still the most common industry sector of employment, followed by Home Health Care Services and Limited-Service Eating Places. Former participants employed in the Other General Merchandise Stores sector had the highest median earnings, \$3,665.

Table 7. Top 10 Industries of Employment for All Working in 4Q2007

Industry of Employment	N Working	Median Earnings	NAICS Code
Employment Services	1,694	\$2,157	5613
Home Health Care Services	1,002	\$1,667	6216
Limited-Service Eating Places	980	\$2,232	7222
Elementary and Secondary Schools	635	\$3,526	6111
Other General Merchandise Stores	598	\$3,665	4529
Full-Service Restaurants	526	\$2,293	7221
Nursing Care Facilities	395	\$3,513	6231
Grocery Stores	333	\$3,043	4451
Traveler Accommodation	271	\$2,759	7211
Gasoline Stations	264	\$3,264	4471

B. Individuals Found Working in Both Study Periods

The first part of this study looked at a snapshot of labor market outcomes for FSE&T participants who exited in PY 2005. This part of the study is designed to more closely examine the outcomes associated with continued employment. Labor market data for participants who were found working in 4Q2005 and also found working in the 4th quarter of 2007 were analyzed.

Participants classified as General Population had the highest employment retention over the study period, with 72.2 percent of those employed in 4Q2005 still working in 2007 (Table 8), as well as having the highest median earnings in 2007, \$3,888 and the largest earnings gains, \$1,467. Overall employment retention for the cohort was 69.3 percent with median earnings gains of \$1,377 between 4Q2005 and the 4th quarter of 2007.

Table 8. Employment Retention and Earnings Gains by Classification

Classification	N	Working in 4Q2005			Working in 4Q2005 and 4Q2007			Earnings Gains/ (Losses)
		N Working	% Working	Median Earnings	N Working	% Working	Median Earnings	
E and T General Population	14747	7531	51.1	\$2,421	5,434	72.2	\$3,888	\$1,467
ABAWD	14,983	7,976	53.2	\$2,496	5,306	66.5	\$3,780	\$1,284
Total	29,730	15,507	52.2	\$2,459	10,740	69.3	\$3,836	\$1,377

Female participants showed the highest employment retention between study periods at 71.5 percent (Table 9). Male participants had the highest median earnings at 4Q2007 with \$4,475. Males also had the highest earnings gains over the study period, earning \$1,587 more in 4Q2007 than in 4Q2005.

Table 9. Employment Retention and Earnings Gains by Gender

Gender	N	Working in 4Q2005			Working in 4Q2005 and 4Q2007			Earnings Gains/ (Losses)
		N Working	% Working	Median Earnings	N Working	% Working	Median Earnings	
Male	13192	6672	50.6	\$2,888	4,423	66.3	\$4,475	\$1,587
Female	16,538	8,835	53.4	\$2,188	6,317	71.5	\$3,507	\$1,319
Total	29,730	15,507	52.2	\$2,459	10,740	69.3	\$3,836	\$1,377

Table 10 shows that Hawaiian Native or Pacific Islander participants had employment retention of 85.0 percent, the highest in the group. Asians had the highest earnings gains over the period at \$2,116.

Table 10. Employment Retention and Earnings Gains by Ethnicity

Ethnicity	N	Working in 4Q2005			Working in 4Q2005 and 4Q2007			Earnings Gains/ (Losses)
		N Working	% Working	Median Earnings	N Working	% Working	Median Earnings	
Unknown	37	24	64.9	\$2,611	17	70.8	\$4,420	\$1,809
Hawaiian Native or Pacific Islander	43	20	46.5	\$2,839	17	85.0	\$4,842	\$2,003
Asian	205	99	48.3	\$2,933	73	73.7	\$5,049	\$2,116
Native American	299	158	52.8	\$2,047	93	58.9	\$3,333	\$1,286
White	7967	3816	47.9	\$2,633	2,517	66.0	\$4,131	\$1,498
Black	10,011	5,498	54.9	\$2,361	3,820	69.5	\$3,788	\$1,427
Hispanic	11,168	5,892	52.8	\$2,429	4,203	71.3	\$3,714	\$1,285
Total	29,730	15,507	52.2	\$2,459	10,740	69.3	\$3,836	\$1,377

Basic Education recipients had the highest employment retention over the study period with 90.0 percent (Table 11). Participants in the Occupational/Vocational Training category had the largest earnings gains over the period with \$2,372, although their cohort size is very small. Job Search Assistance participants had earnings gains of \$1,693.

Table 11. Employment Retention and Earnings Gains by Service Received

Service	N	Working in 4Q2005			Working in 4Q2005 and 4Q2007			Earnings Gains/ (Losses)
		N Working	% Working	Median Earnings	N Working	% Working	Median Earnings	
Occupational/Vocational Training	5	n/a	80.0	\$3,793	n/a	75.0	\$6,165	\$2,372
Basic Education	20	10	50.0	\$2,451	9	90.0	\$3,841	\$1,390
Workfare	211	113	53.6	\$2,426	75	66.4	\$4,005	\$1,579
Determine Good Cause	931	264	28.4	\$1,649	157	59.5	\$3,158	\$1,509
Unsubsidized Employment	6,628	4,071	61.4	\$2,697	2,886	70.9	\$3,969	\$1,272
Job Search Assistance	7,961	3,525	44.3	\$2,463	2,470	70.1	\$4,156	\$1,693
Support Service	13,974	7,520	53.8	\$2,352	5,140	68.4	\$3,661	\$1,309
Total	29,730	15,507	52.2	\$2,459	10,740	69.3	\$3,836	\$1,377

Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.

Exiters from the South Texas LWDA had the highest employment retention of the cohort at 75.6 percent (Table 12). Coastal Bend LWDA exiters had the next highest employment retention at 73.7 percent. Participants from Rural Capital LWDA also had the highest median earnings gains over the study period with \$1,935 followed most closely by Cameron County LWDA exiters with earnings gains of \$1,934.

Table 12. Employment Retention and Earnings Gains by LWDA

LWDA	N	Working in 4Q2005			Working in 4Q2005 and 4Q2007			Earnings Gains/ (Losses)
		N Working	% Working	Median Earnings	N Working	% Working	Median Earnings	
Alamo	1,748	1096	62.7	\$2,813	795	72.5	\$3,969	\$1,156
Brazos Valley	490	265	54.1	\$2,896	185	69.8	\$4,187	\$1,291
Cameron County	405	184	45.4	\$1,930	118	64.1	\$3,864	\$1,934
Capital Area	589	365	62.0	\$3,002	244	66.8	\$4,803	\$1,801
Central Texas	296	154	52.0	\$2,167	88	57.1	\$3,723	\$1,556
Coastal Bend	1047	548	52.3	\$2,158	404	73.7	\$3,255	\$1,097
Concho Valley	329	189	57.5	\$2,507	134	70.9	\$3,806	\$1,299
Dallas	2,479	1,348	54.4	\$2,631	949	70.4	\$4,127	\$1,496
Deep East Texas	995	470	47.2	\$1,978	308	65.5	\$3,369	\$1,391
East Texas	552	283	51.3	\$2,218	187	66.1	\$3,544	\$1,326
Golden Crescent	734	425	57.9	\$2,440	292	68.7	\$3,876	\$1,436
Gulf Coast	9,143	4,551	49.8	\$2,597	3,186	70.0	\$4,291	\$1,694
Heart of Texas	416	232	55.8	\$2,688	151	65.1	\$3,380	\$692
Lower Rio Grande Valley	2,550	1,190	46.7	\$2,030	863	72.5	\$3,204	\$1,174
Middle Rio Grande	484	237	49.0	\$1,983	162	68.4	\$2,983	\$1,000
North Central	676	366	54.1	\$2,812	266	72.7	\$4,287	\$1,475
North East Texas	472	208	44.1	\$1,858	129	62.0	\$3,359	\$1,501
North Texas	527	294	55.8	\$2,241	193	65.6	\$3,183	\$942
Panhandle	399	205	51.4	\$2,087	135	65.9	\$3,258	\$1,171
Permian Basin	677	392	57.9	\$2,446	263	67.1	\$3,640	\$1,194
Rural Capital	128	77	60.2	\$3,196	50	64.9	\$5,131	\$1,935
South East Texas	442	235	53.2	\$2,003	152	64.7	\$3,761	\$1,758
South Plains	329	173	52.6	\$1,835	110	63.6	\$3,456	\$1,621
South Texas	246	135	54.9	\$2,678	102	75.6	\$3,719	\$1,041
Tarrant County	1,237	703	56.8	\$3,147	484	68.8	\$4,577	\$1,430
Texoma	195	85	43.6	\$2,748	58	68.2	\$3,853	\$1,105
Unknown	820	420	51.2	\$2,458	288	68.6	\$3,513	\$1,055
Upper Rio Grande	793	389	49.1	\$1,939	252	64.8	\$3,098	\$1,159
West Central	532	288	54.1	\$2,318	192	66.7	\$3,318	\$1,000
Total	29,730	15,507	52.2	\$2,459	10,740	69.3	\$3,836	\$1,377

Table 13 shows the top ten industries of employment for program participants employed at 4Q2005 and in 4Q2007. Employment Services was the most common industry of employment. Employment Services usually include temporary employment agencies that many employers use to find workers to try out first before hiring permanently. Employers also use Temporary Employment Agencies to augment staff during high demand periods without being saddled with paying benefits for permanent staff. We expect individuals who are continuously employed over the study period to move out of temporary employment and into an industry sector with longer term employment. Home Health Care Services and Limited-Service Eating Places were the second and third most common industries of employment, respectively. Participants employed in the Other General Merchandise Stores sector had the highest median earnings with \$4,033.

Table 13. Top 10 Industries of Employment for Adults Working in 4Q2005 and 4Q2007

Industry of Employment	N Working	Median Earnings	NAICS Code
Employment Services	1,165	\$2,471	5613
Home Health Care Services	666	\$1,807	6216
Limited-Service Eating Places	618	\$2,428	7222
Elementary and Secondary Schools	488	\$3,832	6111
Other General Merchandise Stores	429	\$4,033	4529
Full-Service Restaurants	348	\$2,471	7221
Nursing Care Facilities	300	\$3,664	6231
Grocery Stores	219	\$3,436	4451
Traveler Accommodation	197	\$2,908	7211
Business Support Services	187	\$3,706	5614

References

SNAP E&T Rules. <http://www.twc.state.tx.us/twcinfo/rules/ch813.pdf>

Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program Employment and Training.
<http://www.fns.usda.gov/snap/rules/Memo/Support/employment-training.htm>

Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program Employment and Training.
<http://www.twc.state.tx.us/welref/wrfset.html>

Texas Workforce Commission Annual Report 2007. <http://www.twc.state.tx.us/news/ar07.pdf>