

**Choices
2006-2007 Exit Cohort**

In 1996, the United States Congress passed sweeping legislation to reform the nation's welfare through the *Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act (PRWORA)*. PRWORA ended welfare as an entitlement, instead creating a system of reciprocal obligation, requiring welfare recipients to be engaged in work activities and time-limiting the receipt of benefits. In addition, PRWORA redefined the federal government's role in administering the nation's welfare system by providing states the flexibility to design their own systems. PRWORA offers states an opportunity to enact far-reaching changes that can respond more effectively to the needs of families within each state's unique environment.

The Deficit Reduction Act of 2005 (DRA), signed into law by President George W. Bush on February 8, 2006, brought changes to the law governing the Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF) program. Those changes are designed to build on the successes of PRWORA of 1996 which required states to engage more TANF states to engage more TANF cases in productive work activities leading to self-sufficiency.

In Texas the TANF employment and training program is named "Choices." It includes a wide range of provisions designed to encourage and help individuals make the transition from welfare to work. The goal of Choices is to end the dependence of needy parents on public assistance by promoting job preparation, work, and marriage.

Texas has been a leader in welfare reform with a strong work first message and the full family sanction of all TANF cash benefits for noncompliance with work requirements has motivated many TANF applicants and recipients to seek employment. The full-family sanction terminates the entire family's TANF grant and is not restored until the adult recipient becomes compliant. Welfare reform in Texas enforces the importance of working, the temporary nature of public assistance, and the belief that parents are responsible for the care and well being of their families.

The results of the stricter sanctions have been dramatic. The percentage of adults under sanctions every month has dropped dramatically, while the percentage of adults participating in work activities has climbed. The stronger sanctions have created an incentive for more responsible behavior, driving greater compliance with work requirements to ensure clients earn the full benefit for their family. As a result of welfare reform and the emphasis on work, Texas has been a leader among the states for moving people off welfare and into the workplace.

Since fiscal year (FY) 2002, states have been required to have 50 percent of all families engaged in a work activity for at least 30 hours per week, and 90 percent of two-parent families engaged in a work activity for at least 35 hours per week. The participation rate requirement is reduced by the caseload reduction in the prior year, excluding reductions due to the Federal law or States changes in eligibility. The DRA replaced the caseload reduction credit base year from FY 1995 to FY 2005. Without the benefit of a built-up credit, states must place half of all cases with

adults and 90 percent of two-parent families in work activities. To the extent that states succeed in reducing caseloads, they will receive credit for reductions after FY 2005. Families receiving assistance in separate state programs funded with qualified State maintenance-of-effort expenditures, who were previously excluded from the participation rates, are also now included in the work participation rate.

States are required to establish and maintain work participation verification procedures, which must be reviewed by the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and are subject to a new penalty of one to five percent for failure to establish or comply with these procedures. The DRA also increased the levels of support for child care through the Child Care and Development Fund from \$4.8 billion to \$5 billion per year for five years, totaling \$1 billion.

Methodology

The Labor Market and Career Information (LMCI) division of TWC received 348,469 duplicate seed records for the Choices program from The Workforce Information System of Texas (TWIST). Each seed record represents a unique combination of a client Social Security Number (SSN) and a program service they received. Because many clients received more than one service, the input file included the same SSN multiple times. We grouped the records by SSN and service code and then deleted the records with service codes not used by the Choices program. We then deleted records with invalid registration dates. This left us with 81,793 usable duplicate seed records. The seed records were then separated into “Core”, “Non-Core”, or “Core (with Limit)” depending on the services provided. The seed records were also separated into three activities: Employment, Education, and Training. Once that was complete, the records were unduplicated by SSN and by activity. If a participant appeared in more than one activity, the record for the activity of priority was retained and other record was deleted. The Choices program serves two populations, Adults and Teens, and activities are prioritized differently for each group. The priority activity for Adults is Employment, followed by Training, and then Education. The priority activity for Teens is Education, followed by Employment, and then Training.

After removing the duplicate records by activity, we were left with 37,487 records. Individuals found earning more than \$25,000 in the snapshot quarter were identified and these records were removed from analysis, based on the likelihood of inaccurate wage record data and to reduce the possibility of inappropriately skewing statistical measures of central tendency. This left 37,473 usable, unique records for the Choices exit cohort.

The seed records were then linked to the UI Wage Records database for the 4th quarter of 2007 to determine employment and earnings. Earnings were summed across unique SSN and the 4-digit North American Industry Classification System (NAICS) code of the employer was retained for analysis.

Supplemental employment linkages were performed with the Federal Employment Data Exchange System (FEDES), which includes the U.S. Department of Defense (DOD), the U.S. Office of Personnel Management (OPM), and the U.S. Postal Service (USPS).

The seed records were also sent to the Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board (THECB) for linkage to the public postsecondary master enrollment records for the fall semester of 2007. This linkage is used to locate any former Choices program participants who are pursuing higher education at a public postsecondary institution in Texas and therefore may not be found working.

Finally, the seed records were linked to the Texas Department of Criminal Justice (TDCJ) and the Texas Bureau of Vital Statistics (TBVS) in order to determine if any former program participants were either incarcerated or deceased, respectively. All records with positive matches to either of these two databases have been excluded from subsequent analysis. The remaining 37,403 records were used for analysis in this report.

Results

The results for this report have been ranked in descending order *with the cohort total included*. This was done so one can see where labor market outcomes for various participant groups lie in relation to the labor market outcomes for the entire cohort.

We can see in Tables 1 and 2 show employment and earnings, respectively, for the entire Choices cohort by group. As per usual, the Choices cohort is overwhelmingly comprised of adults, which is why the percentage of employed adults (57.0%) is a close approximation of the overall cohort employment, 56.7 percent. The earnings data are also quite similar. Overall median earnings for the cohort were \$2,508 in 4th Qtr. 2007.

Table 1. Employment by Choices Group

Choices Group	N	N Working	% Working
Adult	36,114	20,568	57.0
Total	37,403	21,221	56.7
Teen	1,289	653	50.7

Table 2. Earnings by Choices Group

Choices Group	N	Median Earnings
Adult	36,114	\$2,554
Total	37,403	\$2,508
Teen	1,289	\$1,464

Just as the Choices cohort is overwhelmingly adult, it is also overwhelmingly female in composition (Table 3). Females had the highest overall employment percentage for the quarter at 57.1 percent. We see in Table 4 that males had the highest median quarterly earnings during the study period with \$3,714

Table 3. Employment by Gender

Gender	N	N Working	% Working
Female	33,434	19,079	57.1
Total	37,403	21,221	56.7
Male	3,965	2,141	54.0
Unknown	n/a	n/a	25.0
Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.			

Table 4. Earnings by Gender

Gender	N	Median Earnings
Male	3,965	\$3,714
Total	37,403	\$2,508
Female	33,434	\$2,403
Unknown	n/a	\$2,359
Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.		

Hawaiian Native or Pacific Islander and Black program participants, with employment of 60.6 percent and 59.7 percent respectively, were the only two racial groups with a higher working percentage than the overall cohort (Table 5). Whites, the largest racial sub-group, had employment of 54.5 percent. Table 6 shows that Hawaiian Native or Pacific Islander had the highest median quarterly earnings in 4th Qtr. 2007 with \$3,262. All racial sub-groups except the two largest had earnings greater than the overall cohort earnings.

Table 5. Employment by Race without Respect to Ethnicity

Race	N	N Working	% Working
Hawaiian Native or Pacific Islander	99	60	60.6
Black	13,629	8,142	59.7
Total	37,403	21,221	56.7
Other/Unknown	7,232	4,069	56.3
Native American	402	226	56.2
White	15,779	8,598	54.5
Asian	262	126	48.1

Table 6. Earnings by Race without Respect to Ethnicity

Race	N	Median Earnings
Hawaiian Native or Pacific Islander	99	\$3,262
Asian	262	\$2,913
Other/Unknown	7,232	\$2,687
Native American	402	\$2,635
Total	37,403	\$2,508
White	15,779	\$2,469
Black	13,629	\$2,431

Tables 7 and 8 display employment and earnings by education level at entrance into the Choices program for the entire cohort. A majority of participants entered the program with a high school diploma or the equivalent (28,515, or 76.2% of the cohort). Participants entering with a baccalaureate degree or above had the best labor market outcomes during the target quarter, with employment at 64.7 percent, median earnings of \$4,545.

Table 7. Employment by Education at Entry

Education at Entry	N	N Working	% Working
BA and above	499	323	64.7
More than HS	5,868	3,646	62.1
Total	37,403	21,221	56.7
High School/GED	28,515	16,090	56.4
Elementary/ESL	2,351	1,087	46.2
No grade	170	75	44.1

Table 8. Earnings by Education at Entry

Education at Entry	N	Median Earnings
BA and above	499	\$4,545
More than HS	5,868	\$3,436
No grade	170	\$2,656
Total	37,403	\$2,508
High School/GED	28,515	\$2,346
Elementary/ESL	2,351	\$2,042

Table 9 shows employment and 10 shows earnings for Choices participants involved in Core, Non-Core, and Core (with Limit) activities. The majority of Choices participants were involved in Core with Limit activities. Some activities included in the Core with Limit category are: Occupational/Vocational Training; Job Search Assistance/Job Search; and Job Readiness/Pre-Employment Skills. Participants in the Core category had the highest employment, 66.2 percent, and the highest median earnings with \$3,067.

Table 9. Employment by Core Category

Core Category	N	N Working	% Working
Core	4,627	3,064	66.2
Total	37,403	21,221	56.7
Core with Limit	32,072	17,817	55.6
Unknown	n/a	n/a	50.0
Non Core	702	339	48.3
Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.			

Table 10. Earnings by Core Category

Core Category	N	Median Earnings
Core	4,627	\$3,067
Total	37,403	\$2,508
Core with Limit	32,072	\$2,427
Unknown	n/a	\$2,397
Non Core	702	\$1,378
Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.		

As we would expect to see, the majority of Choices participants were involved in an Employment activity (Table 11). Employment is the top priority for adult participants, who make up 96.6% of the Choices cohort (Table 1). Employment activity participants had the highest employment at 57.0 percent, and the highest median quarterly earnings with \$2,534 (Table 12).

Table 11. Employment by Activity

Activity	N	N Working	% Working
Employment	36,486	20,789	57.0
Total	37,403	21,221	56.7
Unknown	n/a	n/a	50.0
Education	692	337	48.7
Training	223	94	42.2
Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.			

Table 12. Earnings by Service Category

Activity	N	Median Earnings
Employment	36,486	\$2,534
Total	37,403	\$2,508
Unknown	n/a	\$2,397
Training	223	\$2,266
Education	692	\$1,378
Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.		

Tables 13 and 14, respectively, show employment and earnings for the Choices cohort by Local Workforce Development Area (LWDA). Rural Capital LWDA showed the highest employment in 4th Qtr. 2007 with 63.0 percent employed. Rural Capital LWDA had the highest median quarterly earnings in 4th Qtr. 2007 at \$3,198. The Gulf Coast LWDA had the largest percentage of participants (23.8%), with 53.6 percent employment and median earnings of \$2,595.

Table 13. Employment by LWDA

LWDA	N	N Working	% Working
Rural Capital	662	417	63.0
Panhandle	601	373	62.1
South Plains	846	519	61.4
Golden Crescent	248	152	61.3
Heart of Texas	576	353	61.3
Permian Basin	586	359	61.3
Capital Area	1,350	824	61.0
East Texas	950	577	60.7
Tarrant County	2,050	1,244	60.7
Central Texas	854	501	58.7
Concho Valley	216	126	58.3
Alamo	3,010	1,750	58.1
South East Texas	628	364	58.0
Texoma	102	59	57.8
Middle Rio Grande	513	296	57.7
Cameron County	1,130	650	57.5
West Central	568	326	57.4
Dallas	3,717	2,132	57.4
South Texas	440	251	57.1
North Central	1,402	797	56.9
Total	37,403	21,221	56.7
Upper Rio Grande	2,108	1,182	56.1
Coastal Bend	1,422	777	54.6
Deep East Texas	670	366	54.6
North Texas	328	176	53.7
Lower Rio Grande Valley	2,695	1,444	53.6
Gulf Coast	8,919	4,777	53.6
North East Texas	429	229	53.4
Brazos Valley	383	200	52.2

Table 14. Earnings by LWDA

LWDA	N	Median Earnings
Rural Capital	662	\$3,198
North Central	1,402	\$3,034
Tarrant County	2,050	\$2,924
Capital Area	1,350	\$2,857
Dallas	3,717	\$2,802
Alamo	3,010	\$2,679
Gulf Coast	8,919	\$2,595
Total	37,403	\$2,508
Permian Basin	586	\$2,437
North Texas	328	\$2,432
East Texas	950	\$2,432
Heart of Texas	576	\$2,412
Central Texas	854	\$2,392
Upper Rio Grande	2,108	\$2,389
Lower Rio Grande Valley	2,695	\$2,325
Cameron County	1,130	\$2,307
Golden Crescent	248	\$2,303
Panhandle	601	\$2,298
South Texas	440	\$2,289
Deep East Texas	670	\$2,279
Brazos Valley	383	\$2,273
Texoma	102	\$2,205
Concho Valley	216	\$2,190
South Plains	846	\$2,145
Middle Rio Grande	513	\$2,111
West Central	568	\$2,092
Coastal Bend	1,422	\$2,071
South East Texas	628	\$1,986
North East Texas	429	\$1,872

The Status-in-Group (SIG) code is used to identify two-parent households. Two-parent households are comprised of the caretaker and the second parent. Both adults in the two-parent household are responsible for meeting the work requirements. One or both adults may contribute hours to meet the total two-parent household work requirement. If the household does not meet the two-parent household work requirements, both adults will be penalized, with the following exceptions: (1) exempt adults or (2) adults with good cause status shall not be penalized.¹

Persons coded as Caretaker had the highest employment percentage by SIG code, with 56.9 percent employed (Table 15). As would be expected, Caretakers are the largest SIG code subset. Second Parents had the highest median earnings over the study period with \$3,446 (Table 16).

Table 15. Employment by Status-in-Group (SIG)

SIG	N	N Working	% Working
Caretaker	34,718	19,741	56.9
Total	37,403	21,221	56.7
Other	103	57	55.3
Second parent	2,578	1,421	55.1
Certified Child	n/a	n/a	n/a
Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.			

Table 16. Earnings by Status-in-Group (SIG)

SIG	N	Median Earnings
Second parent	2,578	\$3,446
Total	37,403	\$2,508
Caretaker	34,718	\$2,451
Other	103	\$2,384
Certified Child	n/a	n/a
Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.		

¹ Texas Workforce Commission, Workforce Development Letter WD 35-01, September 17, 2001.

Job Search Assistance/Job Search was the service most frequently provided to Choices program participants, and employment for participants in that category was 55.7 percent (Table 17). Unsubsidized Employment was the only service group containing more than 100 participants to have employment greater than the total, with employment of 67.5 percent for the quarter.

Table 17. Employment by Service Received

Service Received	N	N Working	% Working
Unsubsidized Employment	4,406	2,976	67.5
On-the-Job Training	n/a	n/a	66.7
Total	37,403	21,221	56.7
Job Search Assistance/Job Search	30,968	17,242	55.7
Job Readiness/Pre-Employment Skills	938	497	53.0
Follow-Up Services	n/a	n/a	50.0
Education - Other	n/a	n/a	50.0
High School	557	278	49.9
Occupational/Vocational Training	166	78	47.0
GED	112	51	45.5
Basic Educational Skills/ABE	16	7	43.8
Community Service	158	68	43.0
Job Creation/Subsidized Work	16	6	37.5
Work Experience/Skills Training	34	11	32.4
Job Skills/Training	11	n/a	27.3
Non-Work-based Literacy	5	n/a	n/a
Life Skills	9	n/a	n/a

Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.

Table 18 displays earnings for the exit cohort by service received. Participants receiving On-the-Job Training had the highest median quarterly earnings in 4th Qtr. 2007 with \$5,307, although no real inferences can be drawn regarding the program due to the small number of participants. Participants in the Unsubsidized Employment service category had earnings of \$3,111. Participants receiving Job Search Assistance/Job Search had median earnings of \$2,420.

Table 18. Earnings by Service Received

Service Received	N	Median Earnings
On-the-Job Training	n/a	\$5,307
Unsubsidized Employment	4,406	\$3,111
Job Creation/Subsidized Work	16	\$2,825
Job Readiness/Pre-Employment Skills	938	\$2,694
Total	37,403	\$2,508
Job Search Assistance/Job Search	30,968	\$2,420
Follow-Up Services	n/a	\$2,397
Occupational/Vocational Training	166	\$2,343
Community Service	158	\$1,995
Education - Other	n/a	\$1,751
Job Skills/Training	11	\$1,687
Basic Educational Skills/ABE	16	\$1,616
High School	557	\$1,391
GED	112	\$1,278
Work Experience/Skills Training	34	\$1,262
Non-Work-based Literacy	5	n/a
Life Skills	9	n/a

Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.

Limited-Service Eating Places was the most common industry of employment for program exiters in 4th Qtr. 2007, according to Table 19. Employment Services was the second most common sector, followed by Home Health Care Services. Program exiters working in the Nursing Care Facilities industry had the highest median quarterly earnings in the target quarter with \$2,925. Participants employed in the Business Support Services industry had the second highest median quarterly earnings with \$2,818.

Table 19. Top 10 Industries of Employment by 4-Digit NAICS Code

Industry of Employment	N Working	Median Earnings	NAICS Code
Limited-Service Eating Places	2,309	\$1,648	7222
Employment Services	2,219	\$1,983	5613
Home Health Care Services	1,117	\$1,371	6216
Other General Merchandise Stores	924	\$2,614	4529
Full-Service Restaurants	880	\$1,847	7221
Nursing Care Facilities	713	\$2,925	6231
Business Support Services	691	\$2,818	5614
Elementary and Secondary Schools	623	\$2,700	6111
Grocery Stores	600	\$2,161	4451
Child Day Care Services	590	\$2,517	6244

Adults

Tables 20 and 21 show that in 4th Qtr. 2007, adult Females had the highest employment rate at 57.3 percent, while Male participants had the highest median earnings with \$3,745. Overall employment for the Adult portion of the cohort in 4th Qtr. 2007 was 57.0 percent, with median quarterly earnings of \$2,554.

Table 20. Employment by Gender

Gender	N	N Working	% Working
Female	32,193	18,452	57.3
Total	36,114	20,568	57.0
Male	3,917	2,115	54.0
Unknown	n/a	n/a	25.0

Table 21. Earnings by Gender

Gender	N	Median Earnings
Male	3,917	\$3,745
Total	36,114	\$2,554
Female	32,193	\$2,449
Unknown	n/a	\$2,359

Hawaiian Native or Pacific Islanders had the highest employment in 4th Qtr. 2007 (Table 22) at 60.2 percent, followed by Blacks at 59.8 percent. Hawaiian Native or Pacific Islanders posted the highest median quarterly earnings in 4th Qtr. 2007 at \$3,252 (Table 23). Whites, the largest adult ethnic subgroup, had median earnings of \$2,507. Blacks, the second largest group, had median earnings of \$2,479.

Table 22. Employment by Race without Respect to Ethnicity

Race	N	N Working	% Working
Hawaiian Native or Pacific Islander	98	59	60.2
Black	13,181	7,886	59.8
Total	36,114	20,568	57.0
Other/Unknown	6,925	3,923	56.7
Native American	390	219	56.2
White	15,262	8,357	54.8
Asian	258	124	48.1

Table 23. Earnings by Race without Respect to Ethnicity

Race	N	Median Earnings
Hawaiian Native or Pacific Islander	98	\$3,252
Asian	258	\$2,947
Other/Unknown	6,925	\$2,748
Native American	390	\$2,689
Total	36,114	\$2,554
White	15,262	\$2,507
Black	13,181	\$2,479

Tables 24 and 25 show employment and earnings by education level at entrance into the Choices program for adults. Most adults entered the program with a high school diploma or the equivalent. Those participants entering with a baccalaureate degree or above fared best during the target quarter; that group had employment at 64.7 percent and median earnings of \$4,545. Participants with a high school diploma or the equivalent had median earnings of \$2,391.

Table 24. Employment by Education at Entry

Education at Entry	N	N Working	% Working
BA and above	499	323	64.7
More than HS	5,838	3,626	62.1
Total	36,114	20,568	57.0
High School/GED	27,381	15,499	56.6
Elementary/ESL	2,236	1,051	47.0
No grade	160	69	43.1

Table 25. Earnings by Education at Entry

Education at Entry	N	Median Earnings
BA and above	499	\$4,545
More than HS	5,838	\$3,445
No grade	160	\$2,660
Total	36,114	\$2,554
High School/GED	27,381	\$2,391
Elementary/ESL	2,236	\$2,080

Tables 26 and 27 show the number of Adult Choices participants involved in the Core, Core with Limit, and Non-Core categories. The majority of Choices participants were involved in Core with Limit activities. Choices Core activities include job-search assistance, unsubsidized and subsidized employment, on-the-job training, and work experience. Non-core activities are limited. They include job-skills training, educational services leading toward a GED certificate, and parental skills training (Texas Administrative Code §811.25). Those participating in Core activities had the highest employment and earnings in 4th Qtr. 2007, with 66.1 percent working and median quarterly earnings of \$3,100.

Table 26. Employment by Core Category

Core Category	N	N Working	% Working
Core	4,522	2,991	66.1
Non Core	212	126	59.4
Total	36,114	20,568	57.0
Core with Limit	31,378	17,450	55.6
Unknown	n/a	n/a	50.0

Table 27. Earnings by Core Category

Core Category	N	Median Earnings
Core	4,522	\$3,100
Total	36,114	\$2,554
Core with Limit	31,378	\$2,458
Unknown	n/a	\$2,397
Non Core	212	\$1,934

Adults in the Education activity had the highest employment at 61.4 percent (Table 28), while adults in the Employment activity had the highest median quarterly earnings in 4th Qtr. 2007 with \$2,652 (Table 29). Most adult participants were in the Employment activity, which is the priority activity for adults. Employment for that activity was 57.0 percent.

Table 28. Employment by Activity

Activity	N	N Working	% Working
Education	202	124	61.4
Employment	35,699	20,357	57.0
Total	36,114	20,568	57.0
Unknown	n/a	n/a	50.0
Training	211	86	40.8

Table 29. Earnings by Activity

Activity	N	Median Earnings
Employment	35,699	\$2,562
Total	36,114	\$2,554
Unknown	n/a	\$2,397
Training	211	\$2,266
Education	202	\$1,949

Table 30 and Table 31 show employment and earnings, respectively, for adult Choices participants, by Local Workforce Development Area (LWDA). Adults in the Rural Capital LWDA showed the highest employment in 4th Qtr. 2007 with 63.5 percent employed. Rural Capital LWDA had the highest median quarterly earnings in 4th Qtr. 2007 at \$3,214. As with the cohort overall, a majority of adult Choices exiters came from the Gulf Coast LWDA, which had 53.6 percent employment during the study period, with median earnings of \$2,641.

Table 30. Employment by LWDA

LWDA	N	N Working	% Working
Rural Capital	643	408	63.5
Panhandle	582	361	62.0
Golden Crescent	246	152	61.8
Heart of Texas	557	342	61.4
South Plains	815	499	61.2
Permian Basin	554	339	61.2
Capital Area	1,319	807	61.2
Tarrant County	1,999	1,215	60.8
East Texas	916	555	60.6
Middle Rio Grande	482	285	59.1
Central Texas	832	490	58.9
Concho Valley	208	122	58.7
Alamo	2,920	1,703	58.3
South East Texas	618	358	57.9
West Central	546	316	57.9
Cameron County	1,082	626	57.9
Dallas	3,581	2,068	57.8
South Texas	421	240	57.0
Total	36,114	20,568	57.0
North Central	1,367	776	56.8
Upper Rio Grande	2,000	1,129	56.5
Texoma	98	55	56.1
Deep East Texas	657	359	54.6
Lower Rio Grande Valley	2,565	1,397	54.5
North East Texas	406	221	54.4
Coastal Bend	1,373	746	54.3
North Texas	315	169	53.7
Gulf Coast	8,643	4,636	53.6
Brazos Valley	369	194	52.6

Table 31. Earnings by LWDA

LWDA	N	Median Earnings
Rural Capital	643	\$3,214
North Central	1,367	\$3,043
Tarrant County	1,999	\$2,932
Capital Area	1,319	\$2,880
Dallas	3,581	\$2,864
Alamo	2,920	\$2,703
Gulf Coast	8,643	\$2,641
Total	36,114	\$2,554
Permian Basin	554	\$2,551
East Texas	916	\$2,486
Upper Rio Grande	2,000	\$2,486
Heart of Texas	557	\$2,462
North Texas	315	\$2,461
Central Texas	832	\$2,404
Lower Rio Grande Valley	2,565	\$2,371
Cameron County	1,082	\$2,338
South Texas	421	\$2,312
Panhandle	582	\$2,312
Golden Crescent	246	\$2,303
Deep East Texas	657	\$2,285
Brazos Valley	369	\$2,273
Texoma	98	\$2,205
Concho Valley	208	\$2,190
West Central	546	\$2,166
South Plains	815	\$2,164
Coastal Bend	1,373	\$2,149
Middle Rio Grande	482	\$2,099
South East Texas	618	\$1,972
North East Texas	406	\$1,914

A majority of adult Choices participants were classified as Caretakers (Table 32), with employment of 57.1 percent. Second Parents had the highest median quarterly earnings in 4th Qtr. 2007 with \$3,469 (Table 33). Caretakers had median quarterly earnings of \$2,496.

Table 32. Employment by Status-in-Group (SIG)

SIG	N	N Working	% Working
Caretaker	33,497	19,124	57.1
Total	36,114	20,568	57.0
Other	98	55	56.1
Second parent	2,518	1,389	55.2
Certified Child	n/a	n/a	n/a

Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.

Table 33. Earnings by Status-in-Group (SIG)

SIG	N	Median Earnings
Second parent	2,518	\$3,469
Total	36,114	\$2,554
Caretaker	33,497	\$2,496
Other	98	\$2,422
Certified Child	n/a	n/a

Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.

When reviewing post-exit labor market outcomes of by service received, we see that, excluding groups with cell sizes too small to display, adults receiving the Unsubsidized Employment service had the highest employment in 4th Qtr. 2007 with 67.5 percent employed (Table 34). The majority of Adult Choices participants received the Job Search Assistance/Job Search service, which we would expect to see since Employment is the top priority for Choices Adults. That group had 55.8 percent employment during 4th Qtr. 2007, with median earnings of \$2,446 (Table 35). Looking at groups with more than 100 participants, those receiving the Unsubsidized Employment service had the highest median earnings over the period at \$3,125 (Table 35).

Table 34. Employment by Service Received

Service Received	N	N Working	% Working
Unsubsidized Employment	4,311	2,908	67.5
On-the-Job Training	n/a	n/a	66.7
High School	160	104	65.0
Total	36,114	20,568	57.0
Job Search Assistance/Job Search	30,310	16,897	55.8
Job Readiness/Pre-Employment Skills	910	482	53.0
GED	33	17	51.5
Follow-Up Services	n/a	n/a	50.0
Occupational/Vocational Training	158	71	44.9
Basic Educational Skills/ABE	7	n/a	42.9
Community Service	153	64	41.8
Job Creation/Subsidized Work	15	6	40.0
Work Experience/Skills Training	30	10	33.3
Job Skills/Training	11	n/a	27.3
Non-Work-based Literacy	n/a	n/a	n/a
Life Skills	9	n/a	n/a

Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.

Table 35. Earnings by Service Received

Service Received	N	Median Earnings
On-the-Job Training	n/a	\$5,307
Unsubsidized Employment	4,311	\$3,125
Job Creation/Subsidized Work	15	\$2,825
Job Readiness/Pre-Employment Skills	910	\$2,702
Total	36,114	\$2,554
Job Search Assistance/Job Search	30,310	\$2,446
Follow-Up Services	n/a	\$2,397
Work Experience/Skills Training	30	\$2,281
Occupational/Vocational Training	158	\$2,273
High School	160	\$2,151
Community Service	153	\$1,995
Job Skills/Training	11	\$1,687
Basic Educational Skills/ABE	7	\$1,616
GED	33	\$1,339
Non-Work-based Literacy	n/a	n/a
Life Skills	9	n/a

Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.

Table 36 shows the top ten industries of employment in 4th Qtr. 2007 by 4-digit NAICS code for adult Choices participants. We see that Employment Services was the most common industry sector of employment among Adult Choices participants. Those participants working in the Nursing Care Facilities sector earned the highest median quarterly earnings in 4th Qtr. 2007 at \$2,925.

Table 36. Top 10 Industries of Employment by 4-Digit NAICS Code

Industry of Employment	N Working	Median Earnings	NAICS Code
Employment Services	2,170	\$1,995	5613
Limited-Service Eating Places	2,150	\$1,703	7222
Home Health Care Services	1,104	\$1,372	6216
Other General Merchandise Stores	878	\$2,696	4529
Full-Service Restaurants	839	\$1,947	7221
Nursing Care Facilities	703	\$2,925	6231
Business Support Services	663	\$2,822	5614
Elementary and Secondary Schools	621	\$2,700	6111
Child Day Care Services	578	\$2,537	6244
Grocery Stores	572	\$2,178	4451

Teens

Tables 37 and 38 show employment and earnings by gender for teens in the Choices program. In 4th Qtr. 2007, Males had the highest employment rate at 54.2 percent. Male participants also had the highest median earnings at \$2,072. Overall employment for the teen cohort in 4th Qtr. 2007 was 50.7 percent, with median quarterly earnings of \$1,464.

Table 37. Employment by Gender

Gender	N	N Working	% Working
Male	48	26	54.2
Total	1,289	653	50.7
Female	1,241	627	50.5

Table 38. Earnings by Gender

Gender	N	Median Earnings
Male	48	\$2,072
Total	1,289	\$1,464
Female	1,241	\$1,446

When looking at racial subgroups with more than five participants working, Native American teens had the highest employment in 4th Qtr. 2007 (Table 39) at 58.3 percent and Whites had the highest median quarterly earnings at \$1,560 (Table 40). Whites were the largest ethnic subgroup and had employment of 46.6 percent for the study period.

Table 39. Employment by Race without Respect to Ethnicity

Race	N	N Working	% Working
Hawaiian Native or Pacific Islander	n/a	n/a	100.0
Native American	12	7	58.3
Black	448	256	57.1
Total	1,289	653	50.7
Asian	n/a	n/a	50.0
Other/Unknown	307	146	47.6
White	517	241	46.6

Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.

Table 40. Earnings by Race without Respect to Ethnicity

Race	N	Median Earnings
Hawaiian Native or Pacific Islander	n/a	\$3,615
White	517	\$1,560
Asian	n/a	\$1,468
Total	1,289	\$1,464
Other/Unknown	307	\$1,429
Black	448	\$1,415
Native American	12	\$1,299

Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.

Tables 41 and 42 show employment and earnings by education level at entrance into the Choices program for teens. As with the adult portion of the cohort, most teen participants entered the program with a high school diploma or the equivalent (1,134 or 88% of the teen cohort). Participants classified as More than High School fared best during the target quarter, with employment at 66.7 percent and median earnings of \$1,929.

Table 41. Employment by Education at Entry

Education at Entry	N	N Working	% Working
More than HS	30	20	66.7
No grade	10	6	60.0
High School/GED	1,134	591	52.1
Total	1,289	653	50.7
Elementary/ESL	115	36	31.3

Table 42. Earnings by Education at Entry

Education at Entry	N	Median Earnings
More than HS	30	\$1,929
No grade	10	\$1,505
Total	1,289	\$1,464
High School/GED	1,134	\$1,454
Elementary/ESL	115	\$1,371

The majority of teen Choices participants were involved in Core with Limit activities (Table 43). Those participating in Core activities had the highest employment and earnings in 4th Qtr. 2007, with 69.5 percent working and median quarterly earnings of \$1,968 (Table 44). Core activities seem to be correlated to higher employment and earnings in this exit cohort.

Table 43. Employment by Core Category

Core Category	N	N Working	% Working
Core	105	73	69.5
Core with Limit	694	367	52.9
Total	1,289	653	50.7
Non Core	490	213	43.5

Table 44. Earnings by Core Category

Core Category	N	Median Earnings
Core	105	\$1,968
Core with Limit	694	\$1,713
Total	1,289	\$1,464
Non Core	490	\$1,240

Even though Education is the priority activity for Choices teens, we see the majority of teen participants in the Employment activity (Table 45). Teens in the Training activity had the highest employment at 66.7 percent, while participants in the Employment activity experienced the highest median and earnings over the study period with \$1,763 (Table 46).

Table 45. Employment by Activity

Activity	N	N Working	% Working
Training	12	8	66.7
Employment	787	432	54.9
Total	1,289	653	50.7
Education	490	213	43.5

Table 46. Earnings by Activity

Activity	N	Median Earnings
Employment	787	\$1,763
Training	12	\$1,602
Total	1,289	\$1,464
Education	490	\$1,240

Tables 47 and 48 show employment and earnings for teens by LWDA. Excluding LWDA's with participants too few to display, the East Texas LWDA showed the highest employment in 4th Qtr. 2007 with 64.7 percent employed. Middle Rio Grande LWDA had the highest median quarterly earnings in 4th Qtr. 2007 at \$2,699. A majority of Choices Teen exiters came from the Gulf Coast LWDA (as with Adults), and had 51.1 percent employment in 4th Qtr. 2007 with median earnings of \$1,553.

Table 47. Employment by LWDA

LWDA	N	N Working	% Working
Texoma	n/a	n/a	100.0
East Texas	34	22	64.7
South Plains	31	20	64.5
Coastal Bend	49	31	63.3
Panhandle	19	12	63.2
Permian Basin	32	20	62.5
South East Texas	10	6	60.0
North Central	35	21	60.0
Heart of Texas	19	11	57.9
South Texas	19	11	57.9
Tarrant County	51	29	56.9
Capital Area	31	17	54.8
North Texas	13	7	53.9
Deep East Texas	13	7	53.9
Alamo	90	47	52.2
Gulf Coast	276	141	51.1
Total	1,289	653	50.7
Concho Valley	8	4	50.0
Central Texas	22	11	50.0
Cameron County	48	24	50.0
Upper Rio Grande	108	53	49.1
Rural Capital	19	9	47.4
Dallas	136	64	47.1
West Central	22	10	45.5
Brazos Valley	14	6	42.9
Lower Rio Grande Valley	130	47	36.2
Middle Rio Grande	31	11	35.5
North East Texas	23	8	34.8
Golden Crescent	n/a	n/a	n/a
Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.			

Table 48. Earnings by LWDA

LWDA	N	Median Earnings
Middle Rio Grande	31	\$2,699
South East Texas	10	\$2,590
Rural Capital	19	\$2,436
Concho Valley	8	\$2,218
South Texas	19	\$2,155
Brazos Valley	14	\$2,042
Heart of Texas	19	\$1,968
Panhandle	19	\$1,920
Texoma	n/a	\$1,853
Capital Area	31	\$1,798
North Central	35	\$1,780
Dallas	136	\$1,554
Gulf Coast	276	\$1,553
Central Texas	22	\$1,537
Deep East Texas	13	\$1,523
Tarrant County	51	\$1,487
Coastal Bend	49	\$1,464
Total	1,289	\$1,464
South Plains	31	\$1,413
Lower Rio Grande Valley	130	\$1,365
Permian Basin	32	\$1,353
Alamo	90	\$1,307
West Central	22	\$1,297
Cameron County	48	\$1,274
Upper Rio Grande	108	\$1,240
North Texas	13	\$1,198
North East Texas	23	\$1,110
East Texas	34	\$1,070
Golden Crescent	n/a	n/a
Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.		

As with the adults, a majority of teen Choices participants were classified as Caretakers (Table 49), with employment of 50.5 percent. Teens classified as Certified Child had the highest employment during the study period at 66.7 percent. Of the statistically significant groups, Second Parents had the highest median quarterly earnings in 4th Qtr. 2007 with \$2,072 (Table 50). Caretakers had median quarterly earnings of \$1,454.

Table 49. Employment by Status-in-Group (SIG)

SIG	N	N Working	% Working
Certified Child	n/a	n/a	n/a
Second parent	60	32	53.3
Total	1,289	653	50.7
Caretaker	1,221	617	50.5
Other	5	n/a	40.0

Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.

Table 50. Earnings by Status-in-Group (SIG)

SIG	N	Median Earnings
Second parent	60	\$2,072
Total	1,289	\$1,464
Caretaker	1,221	\$1,454
Other	5	\$1,307
Certified Child	n/a	n/a

Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.

As with adult Choices participants, the majority of teen Choices participants received the Job Search Assistance/Job Search service. That group had 52.4 percent employment during 4th Qtr. 2007 (Table 51) with median earnings of \$1,626 (Table 52). Amongst groups with substantial numbers, teen participants receiving the Unsubsidized Employment service had the highest employment at 71.6 percent, and the highest median earnings at \$2,017.

Table 51. Employment by Service Received

Service Received	N	N Working	% Working
Occupational/Vocational Training	8	7	87.5
Community Service	5	n/a	80.0
Unsubsidized Employment	95	68	71.6
Job Readiness/Pre-Employment Skills	28	15	53.6
Job Search Assistance/Job Search	658	345	52.4
Total	1,289	653	50.7
Education - Other	n/a	n/a	50.0
Basic Educational Skills/ABE	9	n/a	44.4
High School	397	174	43.8
GED	79	34	43.0
Work Experience/Skills Training	n/a	n/a	25.0
Job Creation/Subsidized Work	n/a	n/a	n/a
Non-Work-based Literacy	n/a	n/a	n/a

Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.

Table 52. Earnings by Service Received

Service Received	N	Median Earnings
Occupational/Vocational Training	8	\$2,412
Job Readiness/Pre-Employment Skills	28	\$2,227
Unsubsidized Employment	95	\$2,017
Basic Educational Skills/ABE	9	\$2,010
Education - Other	n/a	\$1,751
Job Search Assistance/Job Search	658	\$1,626
Community Service	5	\$1,584
Total	1,289	\$1,464
High School	397	\$1,222
GED	79	\$1,109
Work Experience/Skills Training	n/a	\$792
Job Creation/Subsidized Work	n/a	n/a
Non-Work-based Literacy	n/a	n/a

Note: Cells with values less than 5 are marked "n/a" to protect the privacy of cohort members.

Table 53 shows the top ten industries of employment for teens found working in 4th Qtr. 2007. Limited-Service Eating Places was the most common industry sector of employment among teen Choices participants found employed during 4th Qtr. 2007 (Table 59). Those participants working in the Business Support Services sector earned the highest median quarterly earnings in 4th Qtr. 2007 at \$2,599.

Table 53. Top 10 Industries of Employment by 4-Digit NAICS Code

Industry of Employment	N Working	Median Earnings	NAICS Code
Limited-Service Eating Places	159	\$1,291	7222
Employment Services	49	\$1,127	5613
Other General Merchandise Stores	46	\$1,871	4529
Full-Service Restaurants	41	\$1,099	7221
Gasoline Stations	29	\$1,713	4471
Grocery Stores	28	\$1,483	4451
Business Support Services	28	\$2,599	5614
Clothing Stores	24	\$1,205	4481
Department Stores	23	\$1,310	4521
Home Health Care Services	13	\$1,266	6216

Post-Exit Educational Pursuit

Table 54 shows the ten higher education institutions with the most Choices program participants enrolled in the Fall of 2008. The Houston Community College had the largest number of program participants enrolled. Overall, only 1.6 percent of the cohort was found enrolled in higher education in 2008.

**Table 54. Top 10 Higher Education Institutions,
All Choices Participants Enrolled in Fall 2008**

Institution	N	% of All Enrolled	% of Cohort
Houston Community College	132	7.1	0.4
El Paso Community College District	81	4.4	0.2
South Texas College	76	4.1	0.2
Austin Community College	56	3.0	0.2
Texas Southern University	53	2.9	0.1
St. Philip's College	47	2.5	0.1
DCCCD El Centro College	44	2.4	0.1
San Antonio College	44	2.4	0.1
McLennan Community College	41	2.2	0.1
Temple College	38	2.1	0.1

Table 55 shows the ten programs of instruction with the most Choices participants enrolled in Fall 2008, by Classification of Instructional Program (CIP) title. We see the majority of enrollees were found enrolled in General Studies. This really is not indicative of anything, and that CIP title is generally used as a “catch-all” for people who have not decided on a specific liberal arts major. Nursing - Registered Nurse Training (RN, ASN, BSN, MSN) was the CIP with the second highest number of enrollees. A large percentage of exiters from this cohort found enrolled in higher education were found enrolled in non-technical programs.

Table 55. Top 10 CIP Titles for All Choices Participants Enrolled in Fall 2008

CIP Title	N	% of All Enrolled	% of Cohort
General Studies	242	13.4	0.7
Nursing - Registered Nurse Training (RN, ASN, BSN, MSN)	142	7.8	0.4
Liberal Arts and Sciences/Liberal Studies	107	5.9	0.3
Multi-/Interdisciplinary Studies, Other	85	4.7	0.2
Undeclared	85	4.7	0.2
Licensed Practical /Vocational Nurse Training (LPN, LVN, Cert, Dipl, AAS)	64	3.5	0.2
Business Administration and Management, General	59	3.3	0.2
Criminal Justice/Safety Studies	43	2.4	0.1
Administrative Assistant and Secretarial Science, General	39	2.2	0.1
Business/Commerce, General	36	2.0	0.1

References

- Texas Workforce Commission Annual Report 2007. <http://www.twc.state.tx.us/news/ar07.pdf>
- Temporary Assistance for Needy Families Employment and Training.
<http://www.twc.state.tx.us/welref/wrchoices.html>
- Temporary Assistance for Needy Families Employment and Training (Choices)
Guidelines and Rules. <http://www.twc.state.tx.us/welref/wrchoices.html#rules>
- Texas TANF Work Verification Plan. http://www.twc.state.tx.us/welref/tanf_workver_plan.pdf
- United States Department of Health and Human Services. <http://www.hhs.gov/>